

## *The Madhya Pradesh Human Development Report : An Introduction*

The use of measures of well-being and quality of life as indicators of human development has found an increasingly vocal constituency in the development sector. People's access to resources-human, material and infrastructure is now widely accepted as a more relevant measure of their status than traditional income-based comparisons. While income continues to be a factor in measures of human development, it is now considered only in combination with measures of education and life-chances. Planners and policy-makers are looking more seriously at efforts to satisfactorily evolve a simple composite index, derived from measures of outcomes for knowledge, longevity and livelihood, as well as reflecting the availability of resources for a good life. The Madhya Pradesh Human Development Report is an effort in consonance with this series of initiatives.

The Government of Madhya Pradesh has taken the initiative of preparing a Madhya Pradesh Human Development Report (henceforth MPHDR), presenting district-level data on people's well-being as well as deprivation vis-à-vis education, health and livelihoods, for a credible and transparent documentation of human development in the state. The Report delineates the existing situation of the state in clear terms, using data already available so that policy formulation and planning can have more or less clear benchmarks on which to base future strategies.

Before we analyse human development in Madhya Pradesh specifically, it is important to define our terms and objectives in general. We shall first elaborate upon the concept of human development and Human Development Reports (HDRs). A brief overview on the development of Madhya Pradesh will then be followed by an

explanation of the objectives and structure of the MPHDR.

### **THE CONCEPT OF "HUMAN DEVELOPMENT"**

Human development is the combination of people's entitlements and attainments relating to education, health and livelihood. These three arenas, taken together, form the everyday experience of "development" for the people as individuals and as members of a community, state or nation. Human development is, then, the sum of outcomes relating to schooling (both access to schools and quality of schooling), health services (both access to hospitals and medicare experts, and quality of life-chances such as life expectancy and nutrition), and income (both access to a secure and adequate livelihood and the quality of consumer choices that flow from it).

"Human Development" as a concept in the 19th century was the menstruation and analysis of the vital and body parameters of small groups (known as "humance groups") in a particular habitat such as the Niger delta, the Alleghenies in upstate New York, the Bayoudwellers in Louisiana or any area similar in scale, catering to a more or less ethnically uniform cohort of inhabitants. Doctors catering to particular communities in rural America, missionaries and later anthropologists in the African "copper belt" were the pioneer users of the concept of "human development".

In the late 1970s, the notion of human development expanded beyond the confines of medical practice and anthropology to the intellectual discourse of development economics. It was successor here to the notion of "physical quality of life" which had been put forth as a subject of menstruation and planning focus by critics

of national income comparisons between economics.<sup>1</sup>

In 1979, Morris David Morris came out with a highly controversial yet seminal work on the use of a physical quality of life index (PQLI) to measure the status of poverty versus well-being in developing economies, especially India. Morris argued that income comparisons between nations and between regions in the same nation were flawed in that they did not indicate the levels of satisfaction or quality of life derived from income. His argument was not that income was too wide a concept to specify development. He argued, instead, that it was too narrow to encompass the outcomes of choice and constraint for individuals, communities and nations. The contention that choice and satisfaction derived from income anyway was rejected by Morris on the grounds that it implied an implicit formula for conversion of income into choice which was unscientific since it could not be clearly defined.<sup>2</sup>

Morris and other critics argued that the cross-national income comparison derived from GDP to population ratio was not relevant for "measuring the condition of the world's poor". It provided a datum of per capita income which could be used to rank countries, but it had little explanatory force. It could not reflect the position of the weaker sections of the society. It reflected income as an input rather than a developmental outcome. Moreover, the linkage with the everyday lives and activities of the people was very weak. Development strategists therefore required new indices to better understand the impact of outlay upon society.

Since the late 1980s, planners and policy makers have used the concept and measurable parameters of human development to argue for outcome-oriented focusing and monitoring of plan outlays in the social sectors of poverty alleviation (both rural and urban), education and health.

The idea of evaluating development strategies in the light of the difference they make in the everyday lives of the people, as reflected in the human development parameters of education, health, etc., has been concretised in Human Development Reports. Today, Human Development Reports also focus on diverse issues such as women's empowerment, citizen's rights and human rights, defence expenditure, AIDS, as well as silent emergencies of the environment, domestic abuse, etc. At the core of all these efforts was the opinion that income alone does not capture the essence of people's lives. Additional measures were needed, sensitised to issues that were not directly reflected in income measures of National Accounting schemes. The inadequacies of pure economic/income comparisons were seen as reasons for devising measures of human well-being which cover non-economic (often non-menstruate) arenas of everyday life. For planning and development initiatives, it was these measures which covered both qualitative as well as quantitative aspects of human existence. At the same time, it was felt that "human development" needed to be demarcated, for practical and logical purposes, from development in general.

#### *Measurement of Human Development: The Human Development Index*

The relevance of human development does not have to be explained to its "objects", "beneficiaries" or "target groups", for whom schooling, health care, access to drinking water, roads and electricity have a direct immediacy and relevance. In this sense, one can say that the poor live and breathe the reality of human development. They may not articulate the concept of human development, but as a daily problem of sustenance and of work, it is a direct experience for them.

However, for policy-makers, planners and academicians, the "measuring scheme" of human

development, the issue of quantifying human development, assumes great significance. It is impossible, and perhaps undesirable, to evolve universally valid measures of human development. Any measuring scheme of human development cannot be all-embracing in that it cannot include each and every aspect of development and the development experience. Many factors, especially those relating to the quality of or satisfaction from education or health, have a subjective element which hinders comparability between persons, groups and societies. An index of human development has to balance the ideal with the practical like politics, it may be described as "the art of the possible". Therefore, measurability is the main methodological lemma of all attempts to ensure human development.

While the notion of PQLI generated much debate in the early 1980s, it was only with the UNDP 's Human Development Reports (HDRs), beginning in 1990 that a large constituency of planners and other sectors in the development sector focused seriously on non economic measures of well-being as an aid to planning and resource allocation.

#### *UNDP's Human Development Reports:*

##### *Overview and Significance*

The backdrop to efforts to evolve human development measures and prepare Human Development Reports was contrapuntal to the focus on "hard" data and issues of income and infrastructure in the World Development Reports. While the World Bank had concentrated on income and economic measures of development, UNDP argued that it was necessary to go beyond the "economistic fallacy" where income and life-chances were seen as interchangeable. It was proposed that "non-economic" measures (including political and

social indicators of development) were more relevant to the lived experiences of people as far as "development" and "quality of life" were concerned.

The concept of human development, as put forward by UNDP, is a people-centered approach to development where the primary concern is "to create an enabling environment for people to enjoy long, healthy and creative lives". This condition may be created by "increasing people's choices"-and the use to which these increased options may be put. Human development therefore corresponds to a holistic approach in the process of development.

The Human Development Reports (HDRs) published annually by the UNDP since 1990 may be regarded as the first worldwide attempt to look at development in terms of human well-being and welfare, away from the confines of economic development.

The Human Development Report 1990 analyses the record of human development for the last three decades and the experience of 14 countries in managing economic growth and human development. The Report discusses the meaning and measurement of human development, proposing a new composite index with longevity, knowledge and wealth as the principal indices. HDR 1990 concludes that there is no automatic link between economic growth and human progress, and that modest levels of income may result in fairly respectable levels of human development. This may be brought about by reallocation of resources according to human development priorities along with a favourable external environment and aid facilities. A sustainable development approach has been suggested along with active popular and NGO participation for successful human development.

While HDR 1990 emphasises the concept, components and parameters of human development, the subsequent Reports have central themes, which broadened the premises of HDRs. HDR 1991 points to an enormous potential for restructuring of both national budgets and international aid allocations in favour of human development. HDR 1992 focuses on the global dimensions of human development. Since unequal competition prevails in the global market a two-pronged strategy focusing on strengthening national technological capabilities and providing institutions working for a new economic order becomes imperative. HDR 1993 has people's participation as the central theme, identifying three major means of such participation: people-friendly markers, decentralisation of power and community organisations (NGOs). HDR 1994 focuses on human security in all its ramifications to ensure universal primary education, primary health care, safe drinking water and sanitation facilities, optimum nutrition levels and credit for self employment opportunities. The 1995 HDR has as its main theme the empowerment of women and suggests global and state strategies to this end.

In the light of the foregoing, the specific context of this Report needs to be stated.

### **MADHYA PRADESH: THE CONTEXT**

Madhya Pradesh is the largest, and according to most interstate comparisons, one of the most backward states in the country. It is sufficient here to state that while the natural resource endowment of the state puts it among the top-ranking states as far as resources are concerned, its very size and variations in terrain and agro climatic zones militates against effective statewide service delivery systems for the benefits derived from these resources. The tables and facts in this

### **INDIAN DISCUSSIONS OF UNDP'S HUMAN DEVELOPMENT INDEX**

Indian scholars have contributed both to the formulation of UNDP's HDI and to the debates amongst development economists on its utility and accuracy. Dutta et al offer a critique on the methodology of HDI calculation by introducing notions of intrinsic social indicators and relative deprivation. In this study Madhya Pradesh offers a picture of increasing gender disparity and low achievement indices in education and health. Parikh (1995) emphasises environmental sustainability along with compulsory primary education with 100 per cent enrollment, drastic reduction of infant mortality to 20 or less, and implementation of an employment guarantee scheme through a watershed development programme. In Sudershan (ed. 1994), environmental sustainability in development remains an area of prime concern. Prabhu and Chatterjee (1993) point out that the human development scenario has large inter-state, intra-state and rural-urban variations and that achievements and access to facilities lag far behind the required level. Analysis of state expenditures shows that Madhya Pradesh occupied one of the last three positions in per capita expenditure and social sector spending. The case is for a simultaneous rise in all sectors of social expenditure, viz. health, education and nutrition, given their "synergistic relationship". Chandrasekhar (1993) pointed out that the areas of immediate attention are food, employment and environment. The emphasis on people's participation (HDR 1993) should also keep in mind the adverse consequences of such a process. In his view this involves a "reformulation" of the role of the state as pioneer and "participation is the device that can ensure that transition, monitor its effects and shape corrective responses when required".

Report will provide further documentation of the context in which human development initiatives have proceeded in this state. However, the context of human development is both real-time as well as historical. It is a picture of both current gaps between expectation and reality as well as enduring and entrenched backwardness.

Indeed, the historical backdrop of the backwardness of the various regions that came to form Madhya Pradesh has overshadowed-all initiatives, both governmental and non-governmental, to promote human development. In the words of Jawaharlal Nehru, "... The deadweight of history has decreed that the state is backward today because it was extremely backward yesterday and the day before yesterday and the day and the years before that."

Given the historical burden of "colonial backwardness", the scenario of human development in Madhya Pradesh is indeed grim, as subsequent sections and chapters indicate. Whether it is education, health or livelihoods, outcomes (such as literacy and school enrollment, fertility and access to health services, etc.) relating to quality of life and entitlements of the people are far from satisfactory. The background of the state's genesis and a perspective of continuity and change since its formation will put things in a proper context.

Before analysing Madhya Pradesh's balance sheet with regard to human development, a brief overview of the state itself is needed to better comprehend the issue of poverty versus well-being. The following section attempts to enumerate the salient features of the state, its regional and rural diversity as also the baggage of historical backwardness it inherited at the time of its formation. This section provides a backdrop framing the issue of human development in Madhya Pradesh.

In 1947, Madhya Pradesh was an amalgamation of the

pre-independence Central Provinces (whence the name), and the principalities of the Chhattisgarh feudatory states, Surguja, Raigarh and Bastar. Coterminous with this unit were the Category "B" state of Madhya Bharat (comprising mainly of the Gwalior and Indore kingdoms, their feudatories and the states of the Central India Agency), the Category "C" state of Vindhya Pradesh and the "Chief Commissioner's Province" of Bhopal. In the reorganisation of states in 1955, these were merged and the Sironj tehsil transferred from Rajasthan. The Marathi-speaking districts of Nagpur, Wardha, Chanda, Bhandara, Akola, Amaravati, Yeotmal and Dhule were transferred to what is now Maharashtra. Nimar was divided into East Nimar (Khandwa) and West Nimar (Khargone). On November 1, 1956, the state of Madhya Pradesh with its current boundaries was reconstituted, and the state government assumed office under the chief ministership of Pandit Ravishankar Shukla. Originally, the state comprised 43 districts. In 1972, the Bhopal and Rajnandgaon districts were created.

At the time of its inception, Madhya Pradesh was a predominantly agricultural state with a very large tribal population. The major towns were Gwalior, Indore, Bhopal, Jabalpur and Raipur. The main function of these centres was administrative, military, trading or as junction-points on trade and communications routes. Nearly forty years since then, the scenario is marked by considerable continuity and some change. The state's primary urban centres have remained the same. However, pockets of industrial growth have emerged in Pithampur, Dewas, Malanpur, Mandideep and on the outskirts of most major towns, especially the rajbhogi towns.

The state (not to be confused with the government alone) has made remarkable progress in the fields of poverty eradication, control of disease, pestilence and famine, as well as in greater

harvesting of its natural and industrial productive assets. However, considerable gaps remain to be covered. The strategies for the exploitation of its forest and mineral resources need some reassessment in terms of prospects for "sustainable development" of the state. Moreover, certain problems of habitat and environment have been aggravated by the very process of "development" in the state. Desertification and degradation of its forest covers as well as increased biotic pressure on resources related to civic infrastructure, e.g., drinking water these are problems that the state has to confront now more seriously than ever before. More recently, greater attention is being drawn to social questions of tribals' rights, maintenance and strengthening of common property resources. Also, there is greater sensitivity to issues of displacement caused by mega-projects as also ensuring representation and empowerment of social groups such as women. The state government is evolving strategies and policies for these.

While the well-being or physical quality of life is to be seen as conceptually neutral to forms of social organisation or adopted paths/models of development, there are value references built into the notion of "human development" that militate against such neutrality. Obviously, the model behind the notion of human development as understood by UNDP is that of western, liberal social democracy, perhaps of the Scandinavian variety. However, such models seem often inadequate when applied to the reality of Madhya Pradesh. This is a state where several civilisational processes are at work: sometimes in isolation, but mostly in direct contact, often in confrontation. Broadly, we can see the state's development dynamics as being influenced by the characteristics of its several zones.

Taking cultural/historical factors into consideration, Madhya Pradesh can be seen as having not one

history but many histories: those of the Malwa people, and of the Bundelkhand, Baghelkhand, Chhattisgarh, Bastar and Gond regions. Politically the state is an amalgam of Madhya Bharat, Mahakoshal and Bhopal, Vindhya Pradesh, the Chhattisgarh states, Bastar, and the Gond principalities. Constituted as a linguistically uniform entity, Madhya Pradesh has several regional variations. In geographical terms, Madhya Pradesh can be divided into the Malwa plateau, the Vindhya and Satpura ranges, the Sone-Narmada drainage region, the Bastar plateau and the Chhattisgarh plains. There is a clear divide in terms of agriculture between the rice-growing Chhattisgarh belt (which survives largely on rain-fed irrigation and is therefore chronically drought-prone) and the wheat-growing Malwa and Gondwana regions.

Further, linkages with neighbouring states affect regional characteristics within the state. This is partially due to traits not obliterated by the reorganisation of states in 1955 and historical/cultural affinities (for example, Jhabua has many elements in common with Banswara and Udaipur in terms of folkways), but also due to trade-route or railway-route nexuses (for example, Rajnandgaon and Durg are linked to Nagpur on the old Bengal-Nagpur Railway line), mandi/market connections (for example, between the cotton-growing regions of Maharashtra and Madhya Pradesh), and folk migrations (for example, Raigarh is linked to the Palamau, Gumla and Singhbhum areas of Bihar).

Thus, the interplay of intra-state contrasts with inter-state linkages has given a distinctive flavour to the development and social dynamics of Madhya Pradesh. Any attempt to analyse human development must be seen against this backdrop of diversity, since it is likely to have consequential limitations.

## THE MADHYA PRADESH HUMAN DEVELOPMENT REPORT: RELEVANCE AND OBJECTIVES

The Madhya Pradesh Human Development Report is the outcome of the state's strategies in the social sector and also a logical culmination of the UNDP initiative.

The Government of Madhya Pradesh has grappled with the issue of poverty and strategies to counter it since its very inception. The ill-fated experiment of Vindhya Pradesh sensitised the founding fathers of the state to the necessity to have a pragmatic focus of resources along two lines: infrastructure-building and poverty alleviation through interventions in health, education and employment programmes. Even non-governmental, people's initiatives in the state have focused largely on education, health and sanitation, and income generation and self-help programmes. The logic of these strategies calls for an assessment of the efficacy of the programmes and initiatives not in terms of targets but of outcome-based increments or changes in people's physical quality of life and a reduction in their deprivation of access to resources.

The logical outcome of the UNDP initiative is to carry the human development evaluation agenda to those who actually fund and monitor the development process with regard to education, health and poverty alleviation. In India, the state governments play this role, apart from direct interventions by people's initiatives, in substantial measure. Therefore, an assessment of human development outcomes and issues for state governments is relevant.

For such evaluations or reports for Madhya Pradesh, at issue is the record of the state vis-à-vis Human Development and the state of the quality of life for people of the state in terms of education, health and livelihood. Here, we are looking as baseline information on human development in Madhya Pradesh, according to indicators conforming

broadly to these three parameters available uniformly across all 45 districts, enabling significant comparisons. These can then be put up against the human development objectives of the state government. This exercise in comparing reality with expectation, performance with objective, can help us identify problems, evaluate prospects and further refine strategies.

### *Madhya Pradesh and Human Development Outcomes*

Madhya Pradesh is one of the more backward states in the country. Both in absolute and relative terms much progress has been made towards poverty eradication in the state in the last forty years. However, nearly 10 per cent of the absolute number of people living below the poverty line in India reside in the state of Madhya Pradesh. Female literacy rates, infant mortality rates, considered to be important indicators of human development, continue to be far below the national average. It is in this context that the need to prepare a Madhya Pradesh Human Development Report was felt. This study focuses on critical issues relevant to the achievement of rapid growth in levels of nutrition, health, literacy and more effective strategies to combat poverty, etc., in the specific context of Madhya Pradesh.

The MPHDR has a mandate to identify inter-district disparities in the levels of human development. Human development can be measured by an assessment of human development indicators such as education, health, life expectancy, access to drinking water, sanitation, employment and income patterns, availability of infrastructural facilities and resources, etc., at the district level. Thereafter, a Human Development Index (henceforth HDI) can be the basis for comparison between districts.

The indicators selected by UNDP for the preparation of its HDI (UNDP reports first introduced the Human Development Index as a measure of human development), the UNICEF report on the 'Progress of Nations'-country-specific HDRs by various organisations, and the indicators used in the World Development Report have been consulted for this study. The HDI worked out by UNDP is a composite index of three variables, viz. life expectancy, education and income. All three components have been given equal weight. As many as 173 countries and areas have been ranked on a scale ranging from 0.000 to 1.000. UNDP took into account several indicators relating to life expectancy at birth, food security, wealth/poverty, demography, education, communication, employment, natural resources, international trade and indebtedness, aid flows, policy options, etc., and then selected the three variables mentioned above to arrive at the HDI.

An assessment of these reports led to productive solutions. However, for purposes of this study, indicators have been selected depending upon the availability of data at the state and district level.

In the light of the foregoing, the MPHDR will aim to do the following.

- Present the state of human development in the districts of Madhya Pradesh.
- Draw up a district-wise Human Development Index (HDI based on measurable indicators).
- Provide a database of outcomes which can assist further efforts to set human development goals and targets.
- Outline the social content of the state government's policy Initiatives, such as Panchayati Raj, the Rajiv Gandhi Missions and the likely Impact of these interventions on the present human development status.

The methodology of the study is detailed in the appendices.

However, it is helpful to review here the broad steps taken by the project team.

- Review of existing literature on similar Human Development Reports and related development works prepared by organisations such as UNDP, UNICEF, World Bank, etc., for various countries to understand the approach adopted for human development.
- Assessment of existing policies formulated for human development.
- Enumeration of indicators reflecting human development such as education, Health, drinking water, status of women, etc.
- Collection and collation of data on selected indicators of human development from secondary sources at both the state and district level such as Statistical Abstracts of districts, District Profiles, Census of India, etc.
- Computation of a Human Development Index (HDI) at the district level.

The output brings out inter-district comparisons in the levels of human development. These baseline comparisons, apart from providing a "snapshot" balance sheet for the state, will help identify areas/regions for intervention. State and district-level data was collected for this study. The focus was on collection of district level disaggregated data. Such data on human development will help identify issues in human development. It will also help point out districts which require immediate attention from policy-makers and planners. Besides compiling district-level data, this study also attempts to identify issues related to human development such as poverty, income, inequality, and employment.

The expected outcomes of this Report may be summarised as follows.



- To focus priority attention on the human development of the people of the state and to place human development at the centre of the government's agenda, both at the state level and at the local level.
- To serve as an aid for more rational inter-district allocation decisions based on inter-district comparisons. The analysis of districts' performance in terms of outcomes and the status of infrastructure pertaining to education, health and poverty alleviation can allow a ranking of districts according to this menu of parameters.
- As a tool for monitoring outcomes: the variations in outcome can be matched with inputs and performance to serve as a monitoring tool.

## STRUCTURE OF SUBSEQUENT ANALYSIS

The issues of livelihood, sustenance and development in Madhya Pradesh are legion. The state confronts all the problems that a developing region has to confront. Issues related to its forest and mineral resources, people's livelihoods, habitat and environment, people's initiatives, human rights—all these deserve intensive analysis by themselves. Future initiatives may examine these issues in detail. Meanwhile, the MPHDR has set itself a more modest target—the delineation of human development as conventionally understood and as a notion distinct from development in general.

The subsequent chapters in this report bring into closer focus on the status and prospects of human development in Madhya Pradesh. The areas of focus in these chapters are respectively:

### *Fiscal and Expenditure*

#### *Patterns: Interstate Comparisons*

This chapter presents the pattern of resource allocation relevant to the 'social sector', especially

health and education. The status of social sector expenditure in Madhya Pradesh is compared with that of other major states. An analysis is made of the trends in state expenditure to support human development initiatives.

### *Education for All: From Rhetoric to Reality*

This chapter analyses the constraints and situational reality for attaining the desired objective of 'Education for All'. It first explains the status and structure of basic education in Madhya Pradesh. Inter-district comparisons supplement the general issues. The problems and prospects of basic education are delineated. Finally, some action issues for achievement of the objective of universal education are enumerated.

### *Perspectives on Health and Nutrition*

This chapter sets out a perspective on health for human development in Madhya Pradesh. It first states the district-wise scenario for outcomes and infrastructure related to health as a component of human development. After a delineation of the structure and process of health care and various initiatives in health, the major issues regarding the health status of the people of Madhya Pradesh are stated and analysed. Thereafter, some strategies for the future are spelt out.

### *Some Issues of Income and Employment*

This chapter buttresses the discussions of outcomes and issues in health and education with an income profile of the state. It spells out the scenario in the state with regard to various components of per capita incomes, employment, and some infrastructure issues, providing

comparison with other states in the country, and between the districts of Madhya Pradesh.

### *Gender Issues and Women's Empowerment*

This chapter analyses the status of women in Madhya Pradesh with reference to various parameters of human development. It provides a perspective on regional and other variations in the indicators pertinent to women's well-being and access to enhanced human development. It focuses specifically on the provision of physical, economic and political security for Madhya Pradesh's women. It concludes with an overview of the problems and prospects of women's empowerment in the state.

### *Information Base and Human Development Concepts*

This chapter buttresses data issues mentioned in the preceding chapters with the results of an intensive study of the structure and process of human development data generation and use in Raisen district, undertaken by the Project Team. It deals with district and sub district level sources of information pertaining to human development parameters. It then delineates the mechanisms and the process whereby data pertaining to outcomes and infrastructure in education, health and poverty alleviation are generated and used. It also enumerates broad issues for producing valid baseline information for monitoring and evaluating human development in Madhya Pradesh.

### *State Strategies*

Here, the state's concerns with regard to human development are discussed. The strategies adopted by the government for enhancing human

development outcomes in Madhya Pradesh are spelt out, to provide a perspective on the state government's commitment to a social democratic agenda.

### *The Madhya Pradesh Human Development Index*

Finally, this chapter provides a summary of inter-district comparisons through a Human Development Index, calculated for all 45 districts of Madhya Pradesh. Districts are assessed and ranked on the basis of secondary data pertaining to human development outcomes. This is a pioneering attempt at providing a more rational basis for inter-district allocation and for focusing priority attention on human development at the district level.

### *Annexes*

The annexes include a bibliography, a special section on Methodology for compilation of the Human Development Index, and tables with data relevant to human development.

## NOTES

1. See Morris 1979. For a brief overview on human development as the economists' new shibboleth, also see Pal and Chakraborty 1994. While economists have come rather late to human development and economists' studies on human development are of recent vintage, it is encouraging that an influential constituency of knowledge producers is now professing to put people at the centre of their intellectual and policy agenda.
2. Interestingly, the Purchasing Power Parity debates, which base themselves on conversion of incomes into purchasing power with a common numeraire, have a striking resonance with Morris' line of reasoning, often unacknowledged.

3. It did not take into account the human and social capital of economies and social groups. Moreover, the biases of exchange rate differentials influenced the common numeraire in the form of the currency of choice, most often the US dollar. Differences in purchasing power internal to the national economy in question were also not accounted for in this mode of national income comparison. Many of the socialist economies (Jean Monnet's Second World) provided a non-monetised (and certainly not calculated in any of the First World currencies) 'social wage' which was not factored into national income. And North European social democracy combined many elements of income and social support structures for its citizenry. Also, local economies, non market transactions, etc. were not reflected in the national income accounts matrices of almost all nations. In sum, it is fair to say that national income comparisons were seen as both limited in use and in utility for development planning or analysis.

4. Indeed, this reasoning seems to have found acceptance even in the World Development Reports. The World Bank presentation on the 1995 World Development Report argued for a "return to the social" in terms of strengthening the social safety net for those underprivileged sections who are affected by 'reforms' and adjustments.

5. Even in the much-cited North European social democracies, the social security net is now under strain with the new, often non European immigrant populations whose cultural self-expression, community organizations and work ethic do not conform to the cultural reference-points (for instance, in relation to women) of the hegemonic ideologies of these states. Confrontations

between 'race', 'class' and 'nation' are quite real in Europe. See Balibar and Wallerstein 1991 for a cogent discussion of this issue.

6. The major difference, however, between an HDR exercise of the UNDP type and the MPHDR is that the former is by its very nature detached and analytical, while the latter (wherein the analysis is being made by the same agency that is responsible for action i.e., the Government of Madhya Pradesh) has necessarily to reflect a strong commitment and action orientation. The MPHDR therefore has to analyse and suggest, not only as an independent analysis, but also with a balance appreciating the potential, limitations and the nature of the state government, and the needs of human development.

7. Vindhya Pradesh comprised the principalities and districts forming the present-day districts of Datia, Chhatarpur, Tikamgarh, Sarna, Panna, Damoh and Rewa. Formed as a Category 'C' state, it immediately faced problems of food scarcity and lack of resources even to run the state administration. It was finally merged into Madhya Pradesh. The fate of Vindhya Pradesh was a compelling argument behind the merger into Madhya Pradesh of the principalities of Surguja (Surguja, Korea and Chhang Bhaker) and Raigarh (Raigarh, Sakti, Jashpur and Udaipur), which also contained the relatively (but only relatively) more prosperous Chhattisgarh region.

8. We do hope that the responses to the MPHDR generate positive debate and discussion and are followed up with independent reports on human development issues in Madhya Pradesh from our colleagues and critics. This is just the starting point, not the end, of the journey.